

Education, Children and Families Committee

10am, Tuesday, 4 March 2014

Piping and Drumming Tuition

Item number	7.2
Report number	
Wards	All

Links

Coalition pledges	P5
Council outcomes	CO2
Single Outcome Agreement	SO3

Gillian Tee

Director of Children and Families

Contact: Linda Lees, Service Manager, Arts and Creative Learning

E-mail: linda.lees@edinburgh.gov.uk | Tel: 0131 469 3956

Executive summary

Piping and Drumming Tuition

Summary

This Report updates elected members of the Education Children and Families Committee on Amendment 1 (as adjusted) to the motion submitted by Councillor Main to the committee on Tuesday 10th December 2013.

The Education Children and Families Committee heard a deputation from Fiona Maclean and her son Callum Downie on behalf of the Morningside Youth Pipe Band and the Boroughmuir High School Pipe Band on Tuesday 10th December 2013. The deputation was heard in support of Councillor Main's Motion on providing instructor support for pupils studying piping and drumming as part of their SQA exams.

This report is informed by the outcomes of the Council's budget conversation and the budget deliberations of 13 February 2014 and includes options for:

- External funding and Creative Scotland
- Links with the independent sector, and
- Investigating the potential for school and community pipe bands.

Recommendations

The Education Children and Families Committee is requested to:

1. Note the contents of this report
2. Note the progress of options to provide chanter, piping and drumming opportunities for pupils, funded by YMI/Creative Scotland, through links with the independent sector and with existing and emerging parent-led school and community pipe bands and tuition programmes
3. Note the proposal to develop a city wide piping and drumming performance band that rehearses and performs on the same basis as other centrally organised orchestras and ensembles
4. Approve the proposal to offer free piping tuition to pupils studying the bagpipes as part of their SQA music exams at the City of Edinburgh Music School located at Broughton High School.

Measures of success

The measures of success are as follows:

- More pupils have the opportunity to learn chanter, piping and drumming through a range of in/out of school, parent-led and community options
- There are pathways for young people who play chanter, pipes and drums to participate in lessons and performances
- Pupils who play pipes and drums participate in a city wide piping performance ensemble
- Pupils currently studying bagpipes for SQA exams take up the opportunity to receive free tuition at the City of Edinburgh Music School located at Broughton High School.

Financial impact

There are no financial implications arising from this report.

Small group chanter lessons in 10 centres on Friday afternoons and Saturday morning lessons at Broughton High School will be met from a combination of existing Youth Music Initiative (YMI) funds and other external funding sources. This will help gauge levels of future demand and associated future costs for piping.

Parent-led school and community pipe bands, piping and drumming tuition programmes and piping corps will be supported with funding advice, information sharing and brokering of suitable opportunities where ever possible. This will carry no additional costs.

The establishment of a city wide piping and drumming performance band will be met from YMI (external) funds.

Pupils currently studying bagpipes for SQA exams will be offered free tuition at the City of Edinburgh Music School at Broughton High School. The costs will be met from existing Music School budget and the levels of demand will be monitored.

Equalities impact

There are no adverse impacts arising from this report.

There are considered to be only positive enhancements to the rights of the child, specifically the right to a good education.

Sustainability impact

There are no adverse impacts arising from this report.

Consultation and engagement

Consultation has taken place with a range of interested parties as follows:

- All Edinburgh High Schools were asked about: the number of pupils studying bagpipes presented for SQA in 2013; presentation numbers in 2014; where pupils currently receive tuition.
- HITS (Heads of Instrumental Teaching in Scotland) were asked about piping and drumming tuition and funding in their local authority.
- Creative Scotland's Youth Music Initiative on funding.
- City of Edinburgh Music School on provision for SQA pupils.
- Eoin Rennie, parent and administrator of Curriepipes, on parent-led piping tuition in Edinburgh. Eoin provided a presentation on how to set up and fund-raise parent-led initiatives for sharing with other groups.
- Barry Donaldson, piping instructor and a Director with the College of Piping, on: piping and drumming generally; pipe bands; quality tuition; different delivery structures; potential sources of external funding.
- Angus Tulloch and David Johnstone, trustees of a private trust fund about a piping and drumming initiative in the Tynecastle cluster.
- Tom Rae and Grant Gillies about an initiative in the Tynecastle area.
- Gavin Gray, parent and piping instructor at James Gillespie's High School Pipe Band, on setting up and sustaining school pipe bands

Background reading / external references

[Scottish Government Instrumental Music Group Report and Recommendations](#)

[Scottish Government Response to the Recommendations](#)

[The Improvement Service Research](#)

[Instrumental Music Teaching in Schools, Guidance for Local Authorities 2003](#) (re-draft 2014)

[Youth Music Initiative](#)

Piping and Drumming Tuition

1. Background

- 1.1 This report summarises the considerations surrounding Amendment 1 (as adjusted) to the motion submitted by Councillor Main to the committee on Tuesday 10th December 2013.
- 1.2 The Instrumental Music Service (IMS), which remains free in Edinburgh, has never offered piping and drumming tuition. There was some piping provision offered in schools as part of the government funded YMI Formula Fund programme, however this was discontinued at the time of the IMS Review in 2010 because it had been clarified that YMI formula funding should not be used to augment Instrumental Music Services. YMI formula funding should address the P6 target '*to create access to high quality music making opportunities for young people aged 0 – 25 years outwith school time*' and issues around wider opportunities, access and different musical genres.
- 1.3 There are a number of parent-led pipe bands/piping tuition programmes in Edinburgh. In addition there are a number of Community Pipe Bands which, at a certain stage, young people can join.
- 1.4 Because piping and drumming tuition is not delivered within the IMS, pupils studying bagpipes for SQA exams cannot access free tuition in the same way as pupils studying a range of other instruments for SQA exams. Notwithstanding, the IMS is a finite resource and many parents pay for private tuition in a range of instruments.

2. Main report

- 2.1 There has been increasing attention locally and nationally around the provision of piping and drumming, with a focus on provision within Instrumental Music Services. This has led to an examination of how City of Edinburgh Council ensures pupils access opportunities to learn piping and drumming. Consideration is also given to how pupils in Edinburgh studying bagpipes as part of their SQA music exams access free specialist tuition. These deliberations are within the context of the budget and the financial difficulties faced by all local authorities.

- 2.2 Councillor Main submitted a Motion to the Education Children and Families committee on Tuesday 10th December 2013.

The committee heard a deputation in support of Councillor Main's Motion.

Amendment 1 (as adjusted) was moved by Councillor Godzik and seconded by Councillor Fullerton, as follows:

'Committee notes the terms of the motion by the Green Group and that such additional demand cannot presently be accommodated within the existing service without significantly impacting on existing provision.

Council seeks to provide support for the provision of bagpipes and drumming initiatives, in welcome co-operation with the wide parental, school and local communities.

Committee agrees to take no action on the Green proposal and notes that a report on bagpipe provision will be presented to Committee in March. Committee instructs that this report is informed by the outcomes of the Council's budget conversation and the budget deliberations of 13 February 2014, including options for:

- *External funding and Creative Scotland*
- *Links with the independent sector*
- *Investigating the potential for school and community pipe bands*

- 2.3 Some background information about Instrumental Music Services, Piping and Drumming and information gathered through local and national research and consultation is provided below. This is designed to set out the context in which music education sits both in funding and policy terms.

It also provides a rationale for the proposals to provide support for the provision of piping and drumming initiatives in co-operation with the wide parental, school and local communities. These proposals are developed within the overall context of music education including SQA qualifications, the Council budget conversation and the potential for external partners and funding.

- 2.4 Background to Instrumental Music Services

Instrumental Music Services have existed in all local authorities in Scotland for around 50 years and were developed to enhance the school curriculum. There was particular growth in the 1960s and 1970s. There is a link between local authority Instrumental Music Services and national youth music ensembles, with some pupils progressing on to these ensembles (such as the National Youth Orchestra of Scotland, the National Youth Brass, Wind and Jazz bands and the National Youth Choir of Scotland).

With increasing pressures on local authority budgets in the late 1990s and despite a slight decline in FTE, pupil numbers appeared to be holding steady. At the same time there was a rise in the number of local authorities levying charges for IMS and there was a general rise in the level of fees. Most (but not all) local authorities did not charge pupils studying music for national qualifications.

Until relatively recently Instrumental Music Services offered western classical instruments and some voice tuition. Local authorities also continue to provide opportunities to participate in orchestras, brass, wind and jazz bands, ensembles and choirs. A number of authorities do not currently offer percussion/drum kit, traditional instruments (fiddle is sometimes accounted for under strings), voice, piano/keyboard and in one authority, guitar.

In 2013, the Scottish Government Instrumental Group carried out a national review of music services, supported by research by The Improvement Service. As a result, the 5 authorities that charged pupils on SQA timetables removed these fees. Currently 8 out of 32 local authorities offer a free Instrumental Music Service, of which Edinburgh is one. One other authority is considering removing its IMS charges. The remainder charge for instrumental tuition, all with varying concessions available.

2.5 The IMS in Edinburgh

As a free service, City of Edinburgh Council's Instrumental Music Service is committed to providing equitable and proportionate access to the service to pupils in every mainstream school in the city. Agreed as a result of a Review in 2010, instructor time is allocated to schools on a banding system according to school role. A combination of instruments is offered to each cluster allowing for the development of bands and ensembles at local and city-wide level. This policy aligns with Council priorities and ensures the service is available in every mainstream school enhancing the curriculum and providing opportunities for wider achievement.

The Council does not directly fund piping and drumming tuition as part of the Instrumental Music Service (IMS) or currently from the Youth Music Initiative (YMI) funding, for pupils either in or out of school.

2.6 Brief background to Piping and Drumming teaching

The development of pipe bands as we know them, evolved from the army. Police pipe bands have long been established although recently there has been a significant demise within the police service. Neither the army nor the police pipe bands traditionally provided youth teaching. Until the 1980s, heavy industry provided significant support and most of the teaching was conducted via these bands. The Boys Brigades were also a strong area for the teaching of pipes and drums with many areas having battalion pipe bands. This too has significantly diminished in recent years.

The more recent introduction of piping and drumming tuition into schools and music services has been achieved at different pace across Scotland. The funding and delivery models also vary greatly and are complex. There are a number of strong partnership arrangements with local pipe bands, such as in Argyll and Bute. This delivery model is available to a lesser extent in some other local authorities and is made possible in part, through the establishment of the Youth Music Initiative. There are a few sponsorship and trust funded arrangements.

In 2009/10, SQA launched a new suite of awards. Set at SCQF levels 2, 3, 4, 5 and 6, the National Progression Award (NPA) in Scottish Bagpipes provides a progression route for candidates who are learning to play the bagpipes, taking them from beginner stages to an advanced level. This practical-based qualification covers the knowledge pipers need for performing in Scottish pipe bands and offers a consistent approach to the study of bagpipes in Scotland and internationally. The NPA has been developed in partnership with the Piping and Drumming Qualifications Board (PDQB) and is available in specialist centres.

Pupils can sit Higher and Advanced Higher music with bagpipes as one of their instruments.

2.7 Piping and Drumming - Current situation locally/nationally

Nationally, a number of local authorities offer piping tuition through IMS, however the picture is inconsistent across and within local authorities. The Improvement Service carried out national research into Instrumental Music Services between March and May 2013 which informed the Scottish Government's Instrumental Music Group. (Report June 2013). The research asked about Traditional Instruments (which includes fiddle, accordion and clarsach) as opposed to piping specifically, although it is fair to assume that some of the feedback relates to piping. The majority of local authorities employ markedly lower numbers of instructors for traditional instruments than other non-classroom instruments. Exceptions are Argyll and Bute, East Renfrewshire, Highland, Shetland and Comhairle nan Eilean Siar. Stirling has a traditional instrument FTE which is more proportionate with other instruments.

From the Improvement Service Research and consultation with local authorities via HITS (Heads of Instrumental Teaching in Scotland) it would appear that the following local authorities employ bagpipe instructors as core IMS staff (there may be others):

- Highland - 14 traditional instrument instructors (Improvement Service research), of which it appears there are 12 Bagpipe instructors (11.4 FTE) and 1 Pipe Band Drumming instructor (0.6 FTE) (HITS Consultation)

- East Renfrewshire – piping and drumming offered at Saturday Music Centre through IMS open to primary, secondary and SQA pupils (5 FTE tbc)
- Dundee – 1 dedicated piping instructor (assumed 1FTE)
- Glasgow – 1 FTE
- West Lothian – piping instructor (1 FTE)
- East Ayrshire – piping/drumming (1 FTE)
- Fife – piping instructor (1 FTE)
- Angus – piping instructor (0.5 FTE)

According to the Improvement Service Research, 6 local authorities employ no Traditional Instrument instructors in the IMS, although this is inconsistent with information provided to City of Edinburgh by HITS members.

Of the remainder it is not clear to what extent the IMS FTE illustrated in The Improvement Service Research is for piping, a combination of piping/other traditional instruments, or for other traditional instruments only.

The picture is yet more complex. A number of authorities appear to have a mix of core IMS piping instructors *and* YMI funded instructors, which can lead to a 2 tier service in charging authorities (YMI must be free). In Argyll and Bute, the partnership with Argyll Piping Trust supports instructors and means piping pupils are offered a 50% discount on fees.

Of the HITS members who responded, several talked of learning within local/community pipe bands and to a lesser extent of private tuition for SQA pupils.

A number of authorities deliver piping in partnership with pipe bands and/or YMI by way of ensuring there is greater offer than could be achieved by the local authority IMS only. In some authorities piping is largely funded through partnerships and/or YMI.

Officers in local authorities responsible for music education (YMI, IMS and visiting specialists) recognise that the source of funding is generally not important to the end user. Within given constraints officers work hard to ensure there is a range of opportunities available and the extent to which that offer is streamlined and coherent for learners is important.

Creative Scotland provided information for 2013/14 about YMI funding for piping, as follows:

- Argyll and Bute “Mull Piping” delivered by a formal sector piping tutor

- Fife “Levenmouth Pipe and Drum Project” delivered with National Piping Centre
- Falkirk “Falkirk Traditional Music Project”
- Orkney “Piping & Drumming in Orkney Schools” delivered with 3 local pipe bands
- Renfrew “Pipes and Drums” 2 local pipe bands
- N Ayrshire “Traditional Chanter / Pipe Band Drumming” local pipe band & local YMI specialist staff
- Perth & Kinross “Vale of Atholl Piping” Vale of Atholl Pipers

2.8 Levels of interest and activity in Edinburgh

A request to all Music Teachers in Edinburgh High Schools provided the following information regarding SQA pupils:

School	Higher 2013	Advanced Higher 2013	Other 2013	2014 Presentation	Taught by
Balerno	none	none		none	
Boroughmuir	1			1 x Advanced Higher	Taught in a pipe band
Broughton	2			none	Higher pupils taught at City of Edinburgh Music School, Private tuition for other pipers
City of Edinburgh Music School				1 x Nat 5	City of Edinburgh Music School
Castlebrae	none	none		none	
Craigmount				1 x Higher piping 1 x Nat 4 pipe band drumming	Both taught in different out of school pipe bands
Craigroyston					
Currie	none	none		none	
Drummond	none	none		none	
Firhill					
Forrester	1 piper (Music with technology)			1 x higher 1 x Advanced Higher (both Music with Technology)	Both attend Craigmount Pipe Band
Gracemount	none	none		none	
Holy Rood RC	1			none	Outside instruction
James Gillespie's		1	1 x SG	1 x Higher 2 x Nat 5 Several S3 chanters for future Nat 5	In school music dept/band
Leith					

Liberton	none	none		none	
Portobello	none	none		none	Previous and possible future pupils taught in a pipe band
Queensferry					
St. Augustine's RC	none	none		none	
St. Thomas of Aquin's					
The Royal High			1 x Int 2 pipes	Pupil now at Craigmount	Craigmount pipe band
Trinity	none	none		none	
Tynecastle				1 x higher (Music with technology) 1 x F3F4 Advanced higher (same pupil?)	Taught by Pipe Band
Wester Hailes	none	none		none	

The table above shows numbers presented for SQA are low across the city. From the information provided, it would appear there are not large future numbers coming through from lower in the secondary schools. This may change.

The following information on parent-led and school/community pipe bands and initiatives was gathered by Eoin Rennie (Currie Pipes)

- Boroughmuir High School, South Morningside Primary
- Craigmount High School
- Currie High School, Currie Primary, Juniper Green Primary, Nether Currie Primary
- Firhill High School, Oxfangs Primary
- James Gillespie's High School, Tolcross Primary, Preston Street Primary, Sciennes Primary
- Davidsons Mains: meets in Davidsons Mains Primary school as an after school club and includes pupils from Crammond and Stockbridge Primary Schools and Broughton High and The Royal High Schools. Blackhall Primary pupils may move to Davidsons Mains (YMI funding at Blackhall ended)
- Craiglochart – no information on activity in area
- Sunshine on Leith Pipes and Samba Band – may no longer be in existence

- Edinburgh & Leith Battalion, The Boy's Brigade – no information provided

Contact details of most Administrators and Instructors were supplied.

2.9 Proposal to support chanter tuition

The main YMI P6 target programme in Edinburgh is called Sounds Like Friday/Sounds Like Saturday and since 2011 has grown considerably. On Friday afternoons during term time, 10 centres across Edinburgh offer small group tuition. Demand has led this to focus on guitar, recorder and voice. On Saturday mornings a large number of children participate in small group tuition at Broughton High School. Information is sent to every primary school for P5, 6 and 7 children and also to Special Schools.

The proposal is to introduce chanter tuition to Sounds Like Friday and Sounds Like Saturday from September 2014. The chanter will be included in all publicity material and information sent to all primary and special schools in August.

2.10 Proposal to develop school/parent/community piping initiatives

The finite IMS resource cannot accommodate all current demands and there are already overheated timetables in some areas. Like teachers in all schools, IMS instructors have to manage different pressures, expectations and challenges in different school communities across the city.

The development of parent-led tuition/participation initiatives is not the sole preserve of bagpiping interests. There are already a number of after school and parent/community led initiatives around sport, music and other artforms. Such groups are often able to access funding and engage the school community in fundraising activities that are not otherwise available. Rather than deliver all activity, the Arts and Creative Learning team seeks to work in partnership with parents, schools, funders and partner organisations to build local capacity and share expertise.

This approach aligns with the national imperative under Curriculum for Excellence to engage parents in learning in and out of school.

2.11 Proposal to develop city-wide piping and drumming performance band

The IMS currently supports a number of centrally organised schools orchestras, bands and ensembles. This is largely delivered by IMS instructors within their contracted working week.

The proposal is to support a new piping and drumming performance band that would rehearse and perform on the same basis as the IMS ensembles. It will be funded from external sources such as YMI. Pupils from across the city learning piping and drumming will be actively encouraged to get involved. This will be a performance band and not a competition pipe band.

Young musicians performing at concerts and public events gain skills and confidence, and are ambassadors for the city. Such events provide excellent opportunities for recognising and celebrating wider achievement.

2.12 Proposal to support SQA students

The City of Edinburgh Music School is a national school of excellence located within Broughton High School. While not ringfenced, there is provision for the Music School in City of Edinburgh Council's budget settlement. One of 4 specialist music schools in Scotland, City of Edinburgh Music School shares a remit to provide specialist instruction for musically gifted pupils integrated with their mainstream education. Each music school also has an obligation to provide outreach and locally responsive opportunities and City of Edinburgh Music School engages in a range of other activities.

The proposal is to extend those other activities and offer free instruction to SQA pupils across the city learning bagpipes. Music school instructors are engaged each year according to the needs of the pupils in the music school. With the current numbers of bagpipe SQA students in Edinburgh, this can be managed within the music school budget. SQA piping students would attend lessons at the Music School at Broughton.

The rationale for this proposal is as follows:

- The City of Edinburgh Music school can accommodate current SQA pupil numbers within the existing budget
- There is a precedent as piping Higher candidates at Broughton High School are taught in the City of Edinburgh Music School
- Instructor time spent travelling between schools is counted as contact time under their terms and conditions and for freelance instructors (as in the music school) payment for travel time is not cost effective.
- Consortium arrangements for the Senior Phase are being developed where students will travel to other schools to access elements of the curriculum
- This presents an opportunity to expose bagpipe students to state of the art facilities and high quality music education within a highly regarded centre of excellence

2.13 Rationale for approaches outlined above

To 'give parity to the study of piping and drumming, in line with other musical instruments, and provide support, including teaching, for those pupils wishing to study these instruments as part of their SQA qualifications' has significant budget implications outlined below.

To introduce piping and drumming into the Instrumental Music Service in line with other non-classroom instruments, (brass, woodwind and strings) would require an additional budget of £370,000 – £400,000 (c.10FTE).

The budget would see a year on year increase as instructors starting at the lower end of the salary scale move towards the top of the scale.

To resource and implement parity '*within the Instrumental Music Service*' would have a significant impact as another non classroom instrument would need to be withdrawn.

The proposals in this report have no budget implications and will:

- Provide opportunities to learn chanter in 10 centres in the City on a Friday afternoon and Saturday morning (levels of demand may dictate more activity in some centres and less in others)
- Gauge likely future demand
- Support the development of parent-led tuition initiatives and pipe bands at local level
- Develop a city-wide piping performance band
- Strengthen partnerships with funders and sponsors
- Provide SQA pupils access to free tuition

3. Recommendations

The Education Children and Families Committee is requested to:

- 3.1 Note the contents of this report
- 3.2 Note the progress of options to provide chanter, piping and drumming opportunities for pupils, funded by YMI/Creative Scotland, through links with the independent sector and with existing and emerging parent-led school and community pipe bands and tuition programmes
- 3.3 Note the proposal to develop a city wide piping and drumming performance band that rehearses and performs on the same basis as other centrally organised orchestras and ensembles
- 3.4 Approve the proposal to offer free piping tuition to pupils studying the bagpipes as part of their SQA music exams at the City of Edinburgh Music School located at Broughton High School.

Gillian Tee

Director of Children and Families

Links

Coalition pledges	P5. Seek to ensure the smooth introduction of Curriculum for Excellence and that management structures within our schools support the new curriculum
Council outcomes	CO2. Our children and young people are successful learners, confident individuals and responsible citizens making a positive contribution to their communities
Single Outcome Agreement	SO3. Edinburgh's children and young people enjoy their childhood and fulfil their potential
Appendices	None